

ADEE 2011 Special Interest Group: CPD Accreditation/Recognition

Special Interest Group discussion points:

- Q1 In your country is CPD officially recognised/accredited?**
Q2 How is this recognised/accredited?
- official certification?
- Q3 Who provides this accreditation?**
- **The regulator - the bodies/institutions recognised in that particular country as the appropriate body- who puts dentists on the dentists register**
 - **Dept of health or education,**
 - **Professional dental associations**
 - **Other organisation**
- Q4 How is the period of learning recorded – Hours? Credits?**
- **How do hours relate to credits?**

Background

- Educational accreditation is a type of quality assurance process which provides an external evaluation of educational institutions or programmes to determine if standards are met.
- If standards are met, accredited status is granted by the agency.
- Educational accreditation is typically conducted by a government organization, such as a ministry of education.
- Accreditation of CPD provision assumes that the CPD activity is fit for purpose and addresses the needs and requirements of the attendees.

- In the UK for example - the British Dental Association (BDA), state for their annual conference, that all sessions are *'approved for accreditation of CPD hours and comply with the General Dental Council's verifiable CPD requirements'*.
- One might, therefore, assume that accreditation is in place

- However, the GDC itself **does not approve any education provider or course** for verifiable CPD (certified with CPD points). Rather, it **specifies the conditions which must be met in order for a CPD activity (GUIDANCE)** to be considered verifiable and thus appropriately certified (www.GDC-org).
- All four of the following conditions must be met:
 1. A certificate (or other type of documentary proof) that proves that the individual took part in the activity must be provided.
 - should document the number of hours spent by the individual on the activity.
 2. The activity must have 'concise educational aims and objectives'.
 3. The activity must have 'clear anticipated outcomes'.
 4. The activity must have 'quality controls'
 - usually includes the opportunity for participants to give feedback, with a view to improving quality.

- The 'educational aims and objectives' and the 'anticipated learning outcomes' must be recorded on the certificate.
- The dental professional is responsible for deciding whether or not to count an activity as verifiable CPD.
 - Using professional judgement they are expected to decide whether or not the activity meets all four of the conditions for verifiable CPD.

The following information was recorded as part of the DentCPD Project's survey: 'Continuing professional development systems and requirements for graduate dentists in the EU: survey results from the DentCPD project', which can be found – in the Dental CPD Reference Manual pp18-22, at: <http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/eje.2013.17.issue-s1/issuetoc>

DentCPD survey responses - summary

An online survey developed and sent out to contacts across Europe by the DentCPD project asked respondents about CPD accreditation in their countries.

Question 5 – for each organisation listed, please indicate which activities it is engaged in

Question 6 - do you know the criteria for successful accreditation

Respondents were asked to provide information relating to the provision and accreditation of CPD in their country.

Question 5 presented respondents with a list of organisations and asked them to indicate for each organisation whether

- it provides CPD points,
- is accredited to offer CPD points,
- accredits providers of CPD points or
- none of these.

There was considerable variation in the responses. The results of this question are summarised in Table V.

It shows, that in most countries, a wide range of organisations both provide and are accredited to offer CPD points, but mostly the 'Professional Dental Association', 'National Regulatory Body' and 'State Organisation' are believed to accredit the providers of CPD (Table V, final column).

'Accredited to provide' – assumes that there is an appropriate body/institution who accredits the provider

TABLE V: ORGANISATIONS PROVIDING AND ACCREDITING CPD (Q5)

CPD providing organisation	Provides	Accredited to offer CPD points	Accredits providers
University Dental School	28	16	0
Professional Dental Association	26	18	8
Scientific Dental Society	26	13	1
Commercial Company	21	3	0
Private Education Org	20	8	0
Dental Postgraduate Organisation	17	11	0
National Regulatory Body	10	7	9
State Organisation	8	2	6

Question 6 provides an overview of the extent of knowledge of these criteria as applied within national systems. Out of all those responding to the survey, only 67 individuals (41%) believed they knew the criteria for successful accreditation (Q6) in their country.

These respondents were then asked to describe the criteria.

- Many answers did not address the question (for example, statements such as “The scientific program must be accredited”).
- A number of descriptions related to “peer review” or “internal evaluation” processes but did not include reference to specific criteria.
- Criteria that were noted included:
 - fit with core topics,
 - presenter’s qualifications,
 - appropriate facilities,
 - educational aims and objectives,
 - clear outcomes,
 - opportunity for participant feedback and proof of attendance.

A selection of the more specific responses to the criteria for accreditation of dental CPD is provided in the Appendix.

Appendix: Description of criteria for successful accreditation

Croatia

- Knowledge of learning needs and nature.
- Availability of educators, financial and technical support.
- Administrative support and maintenance of records
- Availability of types of educational programmes (methods), variety of topics and their selection.
- Certification, verification, evaluation and feedback process.
- Ethical aspects and independency of commercial aspects.

Hungary

A CPD course may be accredited

- If there is at least one university teacher - a lecturer with PhD or higher scientific grade in the program.
- The course must have a topic which is actual and provides new information or refresh evidence based knowledge.
- A professional body offers specific topics in every year to emphasise what CPD should be provided.

Ireland

- Concise educational aims and objectives.
- Clear anticipated outcomes.
- Quality Control (opportunity for participants' feedback).
- Documentary proof of attendance or participation by the organiser.

Lebanon

A Certificate of attendance should be provided which should include:

- Clearly defined learning aim/s with clear indications of how the activity contributes to continuing professional development.
- A detailed statement outlining the content and structure of the programme.

- The learning outcomes should clearly show how the attendee benefits from the event/course in professional terms.
- A clear statement of what delivery methods were used and
- It should be stated whether there is any form of assessment used within the educational programme of the activity and if there is any, a clear description of this assessment should be provided.
- A statement about qualifications and expertise of presenters/other teaching staff which would demonstrate that their qualification level is adequate to the educational programme.
- A statement indicating organiser's experience in conducting educational/scientific activities, frequency of educational activities conducted, number of similar activities conducted in the past.
- A statement providing information re facilities and organisational arrangements made for the activity.
- There should be a clear statement of assurance that the educational programme of the activity is not inappropriately influenced or biased by commercial organisations.
- The organiser should maintain an attendance register and retain a list of participants for a period of 24 months. The attendance register should be provided upon request.

Poland

- It must to fulfil the special formula in which must be proof that it has competent lecturers, educational base, prepared rules of course organising.
- The CPD provider has to meet the requirements laid down in the law, which include appropriately qualified staff, premises, internal quality assessment system etc.

Spain

- Need to submit information on objectives, full program, faculty and evaluation.

Some respondents were more specific about the 'providers' and the 'accrediting bodies':

FYR Macedonia

- State board - accredits providers of CPD and control the CPD process.
- University dental schools, professional dental associations, Scientific dental societies provide CPD.
- A national regulatory body for dentists to offer CPD points.

Turkey

- CPD providing body applies to Turkish Dental Association (TDA) for CPD points.
- A committee in the TDA calculates the program according to a directory and decides the CPD points.

Netherlands

Recognized by a professional national committee called Q-Keurmerk (independent Dutch accreditation organisation) who require the following for CPD activities to get a 'Q mark':

- description of target group and course
- description of results
- survey and monitor objectiveness (in relation to commercial benefits)
- provide information about didactical set up, means and tutors
- conduct periodical internal evaluation
- submit to external auditing
- define responsibilities course provider, course management and tutors
- manage certification of (partial) participation

It is not mandatory to have this Q mark, but it helps in getting more participants on a CPD activity and only Q mark courses are credited for the Dentist Quality Register. However, this quality register is also not mandatory. Q mark and the Quality Register are both the in-between instruments on the way towards a mandatory quality system either ruled by the government or the professional dental organisation. The website is www.q-keurmerk.nl.

Germany

- Postgraduate Education is accredited by state dental association.

Hungary

- Each semester the Committee of each dental school accredit the submitted courses.

Estonia

- Dental Association evaluates the lecturer's background, structure of the course. Commercial marketing lectures are not accredited as CE.

In USA, the American Dental Association (ADA) established the Continuing Education Recognition Program (CERP) in 1993, recognising the need to support selection of continuing education (CE) and to promote improvement in CE. To apply for ADA CERP there is a requirement to address 15 standards. The ADA CERP standards and criteria for recognition include and can be found at:

www.mmc.edu/lifelonglearning/docs/media-ada-cerp.pdf

1. mission/goals
2. needs assessment
3. objectives
4. evaluation
5. commercial or promotional conflict of interest
6. educational methods
7. instructors
8. facilities
9. administration
10. fiscal responsibility
11. publicity
12. admissions
13. patient protection
14. record keeping
15. electronically mediated distance learning