

CRITERIA to support ACCREDITATION of EDUCATIONAL ACTIVITY(S) (EdA(s))
A PAN-EUROPEAN ACCREDITATION FRAMEWORK for the GRADUATE DENTIST

Introduction

This Framework uses the structure of the European Union of Medical Specialists Accreditation document, UEMS 2011/20 as a template to provide an Accreditation mechanism for continuing educational activities (EdA(s)) undertaken by graduate dentists in the EU. ADEE believes this is an opportunity to support international harmonisation and improve the quality of continuing dental education and training delivered through a variety of continuing professional development (CPD) EdAs.

The DentCPD project (www.dentcpd.org), which was in the main part funded through the EACEA life-long learning, Erasmus programme stated that the consensus definition of CPD, from the past literature, was that *'continuing professional development (CPD) is the mechanism by which dental practitioners develop their skills and knowledge and maintain up-to-date practice. The definitions of CPD draw attention to the career-long importance of CPD and its value to patient care'*.

This Framework refers to 'educational activities' – EdA(s) which contribute to CPD of graduate dental practitioners. The Framework, within this document, should be considered in parallel with the *'Guidelines for the organisation of continuing professional development activities for the European dentist'*. [Eur J Dent Educ](#). 2013 May;17 Suppl 1:29-37. doi: 10.1111/eje.12021. This and all dental CPD areas, covered by the DentCPD project, are displayed in the Dental Continuous Professional Development (CPD) Reference Manual:

<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/eje.2013.17.issue-s1/issuetoc>.

In its appendices are a series of 'toolkits' to support *'needs assessment'*, *'EdA evaluation'*, *'self-satisfaction evaluation'* and *'EdA quality assurance'* for dental educators (and practitioners).

ADEE recognises the wide range of modes of delivery of EdAs for graduate dental practitioners and through the Framework, within this document, propose a mechanism for applying for recognition/accreditation of these EdAs. Equally, there are different arrangements in place across national boundaries with regard to CPD and their associated educational credits. These and guidelines recognised in different nations should be taken into consideration when considering applying for Accreditation of dental CPD EdAs by the ADEE.

To enable provision of evidence of quality assurance of an EdA, 'Providers' may wish to consider mapping their EdA(s) to a recognised quality assurance framework – e.g. Quality assurance Framework for Dental Workforce Development:

<http://www.copdend.org/data/files/Downloads/Quality%20Assurance%20Framework%20for%20Dental%20Workforce%202016.pdf>

This document describes the criteria supporting the mechanism (processes and procedures) for the Accreditation of EdAs supporting the continuing education/CPD of graduate dental practitioners.

Mechanism of Application for Accreditation of Dental EdA(s)

On application for accreditation by the ADEE, the Provider will provide:

- i. a title and summary (including a programme) of the EdA(s).
- ii. a fully completed ADEE application form, confirmed by the educator/practitioner who is taking responsibility for the EdA(s).
- iii. full payment of the application fee.

The 'Provider' will not attempt to influence the decision of the ADEE. Any such attempt will result in automatic rejection of the application and forfeiture of the fee.

ADEE, in dealing with the application, commits to:

- i. ensuring confidentiality regarding the EdA(s) submitted.
- ii. confirming for the 'Provider' the following dates:
 - a. on which the EdA(s) application was received
 - b. on which the application fee cleared, and
- iii. choosing, from a panel of suitably trained educators, two assessors who have expertise appropriate to the EdA(s) submitted.
- iv. providing, via the ADEE website, a progress record that is accessible by the 'Provider'.
- v. ensuring that a decision is provided to the 'Provider' within eight weeks of the date of the proposed EdA(s) or, at seven weeks, if this cannot be achieved. An explanation will be provided and an offer of a full refund of the application fee.

Criteria and Decision-Making for Accreditation of Dental EdAs

The ADEE application form for the EdA(s) will be reviewed by the two designated ADEE assessors/educators.

- i. **Accreditation Criteria** - for a positive decision to be made by the ADEE assessors/educators, in favour of accreditation, all the 'Essential' criteria should be addressed and achieved in the application form.
- ii. The ADEE assessors/educators will be required to confirm whether they believe that the stated educational 'learning outcomes' can be fulfilled.
- iii. In order for the ADEE to accredit the EdA(s), both assessors/educators must support the application.

Essential Criteria for Accreditation of Dental EdA(s)

A. Educational Objectives (Learning Outcomes)

The 'Provider' must clearly state in a readily accessible manner:

1. that the EdA(s) has been prepared in order to fulfil stated educational needs and indicate how this will be achieved.
2. the expected educational outcome(s) of the EdA(s).
3. and clearly define, the "target audience" for whom the EdA(s) are most likely to be suitable.

B. Description of the Educational Activity (EdA)

The 'Provider' must clearly state in a readily accessible manner:

4. and clearly explain, in a brief summary, the 'content' of the EdA(s). This will include the title of the EdA(s) and the latest version of the programme, at the time of application.
5. information regarding the expected number of attendees/'Learners' (and scheduled fees -if applicable).
6. that they respect and confirm the privacy and confidentiality of the 'Learner' and confirm that any information provided by the 'Learner' will only be utilised for the specific purposes of completing the EdA(s).
7. the duration of the EdA(s) in order to fulfil the educational learning outcome(s).
8. compliance of the EdA(s) with all relevant ethical, medico-legal and legal requirements.
9. the format of the EdA(s) – if it is a. face to face b. an on-line/e-learning/distance learning EdA(s) (must provide contact details for assistance provision) c. workshop d. hands-on/simulation etc. e. conferences/symposium/meetings f. or 'other format'.

C. Content of the Educational Activity (EdA)

The 'Provider' must clearly state in a readily accessible manner:

10. that the 'content' of the EdA(s) is evidence-based, with notes on the level of evidence (where applicable), and suitable references.
11. how the EdA(s) will encourage the 'Learner' to employ methods of active, adult learning and reflection on the impact of the EdA(s) to achieve the educational 'learning outcome'(s).
12. that the EdA(s) includes a means of confirming 'Learner' engagement, and achievement of the educational 'learning outcome'(s).
13. that the 'content' of the EdA(s) is free from any commercial or other forms of bias.
14. that the 'content' of the EdA(s) is free of any form of advertising.
15. that the 'content' of the EdA(s) is suitable for an international audience

D. Details of the 'Provider'

The 'Provider' must clearly state in a readily accessible manner:

16. a short description of the 'Provider' organisation.
17. the names and qualifications of the individual(s) involved in preparing the EdA(s).
18. the name and title of the educator/registered practitioner who will take responsibility for the EdA 'content'. This individual must be registered with an appropriate Regulatory Authority, and his/her registration details must be provided. (for conference/scientific meetings this should include the lead individual for the event and all members of the organising committee)
19. the provision of a full declaration of actual or potential conflict of interest of the individual(s) involved in preparing the content of the EdA(s) and or responsible for the EdA(s) (including conferences/scientific meetings).
20. a declaration and statement of the source of all funding provided for the preparation of the EdA(s).

E. Quality Assurance by the 'Provider'

The 'Provider' must clearly state in a readily accessible manner:

21. confirmation that they have applied their own 'quality assurance process' to the EdA(s) prior to application to the ADEE for accreditation. Details should be provided
22. that they provide a reliable and effective means for the 'Learner' to provide feedback on the EdA(s). The 'Provider' must make available, to the ADEE, a report on this feedback and on its responses to the feedback.
23. evidence of an evaluation record for previous or on-going modules/courses/programmes is satisfactory. If this is not the case, the 'provider' must specify how the reasons for unsatisfactory ratings have been addressed.

Amendment Procedure for Accreditation of Dental EdA(s)

The ADEE recognises that some applications may fulfil almost all the criteria needed for accreditation but be lacking in a small number. In accordance with its remit to encourage the improvement of the quality of continuing education/CPD, the ADEE will provide feedback and recommendations for amendments to the EdA(s) submitted by the 'Provider'.

The ADEE will permit the 'Provider' one opportunity, at no additional charge, to submit a revised version of the EdA(s) for accreditation. This amended submission must be provided within three weeks of the ADEE's request for amendment or the ADEE reserves the right to reject the application without further assessment.

The ADEE commits to providing a decision within two weeks of receipt of the amended submission. Other than through the mechanism of 'Appeal' (see below), this decision by the ADEE shall be final.

Appeal

Automatic Appeal – should the two designated ADEE assessors/educators differ in their assessment, an 'automatic appeal' will be triggered, and the 'Provider' will be informed that this has occurred. A further two weeks will be permitted for the processing of the application (viz. a total of ten weeks from the starting date). This 'automatic appeal' will be performed at no further cost to the 'Provider'.

Appeal by the 'Provider' – should both designated ADEE assessors/educators reject the application, the 'Provider' may appeal. This will require a further two weeks from the date that the appeal, and the clearance of the appeal fee, is confirmed as having been received by the ADEE. The appeal fee will be *(to be agreed)*

Mechanism of Appeal – in either case (Automatic Appeal, or Appeal by 'Provider') the mechanism will be

- i. The designated officer of the ADEE (or his/her nominee) will review the EdA(s) and the application form and will discuss these with the two designated ADEE assessors/educators.
- ii. the three will vote on the Application, with a majority (2:1) decision being permitted to confirm Accreditation.
- iii. the appeal decision will be final.

Outcomes of the Application for Accreditation of Dental EdA(s)

Confirmation of Accreditation of the EdA(s) by the ADEE will permit the 'Provider' to use a statement to this effect (prepared by the ADEE) on and within the EdA(s). This will be confirmed on the ADEE website, and the number of European Continuing Education Credits (dentistry) (ECEC(d)) (as one ECEC(d) per hour of education) will be stated.

The ADEE will permit, on request by the 'Provider', the accreditation of translated versions of the originally accredited EdA(s) as long as this does not involve any alteration of the EdA(s) 'content'. This extension of accreditation will be permitted at no extra charge.

Accreditation of EdA(s) will not be transferable and will only be permitted for the defined EdA(s), in the particular format, by the specified 'Provider'. Any breach of this rule will lead to the withdrawal of accreditation.

Application shall be limited to a single process of assessment for accreditation. As indicated in this document, this process normally will incorporate the assessment by assessors/educators, one opportunity for improvement if deemed appropriate (amendment procedure), and the potential for one appeal. Beyond these steps, and the timescales set out above, should the ADEE reject the application, no further opportunity for re-assessment will be offered, other than by a new application.

Fees for Accreditation of Dental EdA(s)

The fee for an application to the ADEE for the accreditation of EdA(s) is determined by the expected total number of attendees/'Learners' rather than the number of ECEC(d)s awarded. All invoices must be paid to receive accreditation.

The ADEE scale of fees are: *(to be agreed)*

- 0-250 'Learners' - 350 Euros
- 251-500 'Learners' - 650 Euros
- 501-1000 'Learners' - 950 Euros
- 1001 to 2000 'Learners' - 1250 Euros
- 2001 to 5000 'Learners' - 2450 Euros
- >5000 'Learners' - 4250 Euros

The full amount paid by the applicant will only be refundable if the ADEE cannot provide the 'Provider' with a decision within ten weeks of the confirmed "starting date" of the application, or within twelve weeks if the amendment procedure was activated. There will be no right to reduce the expected number of 'Learners' after submission of the application in an attempt to have a reduced fee. An application already submitted will be charged at the rate applicable at the time that it was made. ADEE reserves the right, in its sole discretion, to change its fees at any time.

The ADEE currently only accredits individual applications for EdA events and does not provide for the accreditation of 'Providers'.

Appendix 1 – Definitions

Continuing Professional Development - The educative means of updating, developing and enhancing how practitioners apply the knowledge, skills, attitudes (and behaviours, and the ethical standards) required in their working lives.

- Workshops
- (e-Learning) EdA, includes recorded audio, recorded visual, recorded on Compact Disc (CD), recorded on Digital Versatile Disc (DVD), available on Personal Digital Assistant (PDA), available online via an educational website, or any mixture of the preceding
- Conferences, meetings, congresses
- Hands-on – clinical simulation
- Others?

??Provider - A distinction should be noted, between the “developer” of the ‘content’ of the EdA(s) and the “producer” of the EdA(s). While, on occasion, these may be the same individual(s), the ‘Provider’ must state clearly who has been responsible for each aspect.

Appendix 2 - Allocation of European CE Credits (ECECs) for Dental Educational Activities (EdA) *(to be agreed)*

Allocation of European Continuing Education Credits (dentistry) (ECEC(d)s) for EdA(s)

ADEE awards ECEC(d)s on the following basis:

One hour - 1 ECEC(d)

Half a day - 3 ECEC(d)s maximum

Full day - 6 ECEC(d)s maximum

ADEE does not award fractions of credits and no more than 6 ECEC(d)s per day can be awarded, even if the EdA(s) lasts longer than 6 hours.

‘Learners can only claim ECEC(d)s for those EdA(S)s, or parts of EdA(s) that they have attended and should ensure that they do so in accordance with their home country’s criteria.

Appendix 3 - Potential for 'Provider' Accreditation (*for future discussions*)

The ADEE provides a system of accreditation that is based on considering applications related to individual EdAs.

Some 'Providers' submit many CE/CPD EdAs for Accreditation.

When such a 'Provider' consistently has such applications approved as fulfilling the ADEE's criteria for Accreditation, this confirms the quality of the 'Provider' and their CE/CPD EdAs.

Accordingly, the ADEE could explore the potential for a system of "Provider Accreditation" that may be suitable for such 'Providers'.

In doing so, the ADEE is considering the suitability of such a system within the European context, noting the experience of such systems, in relation to medical CPD, in the USA.

It is important to emphasise that, until a policy decision is made by the ADEE executive, such work does not commit the ADEE to such a system, nor does it exclude the potential for this.

'Providers' are encouraged to submit applications for the Accreditation of EdAs which, if accredited, will continue to strengthen their reputation as a high-quality 'Provider'.